

Appendix M

Minutes of the meeting of the Planning Sub-Committee of the Land and Development Advisory Committee

**Confirmed Minutes of the
84th Meeting of the Planning Sub-Committee (PSC) of
the Land and Development Advisory Committee (LDAC)
held on 27.6.2013 (Thursday) at 2:30 p.m.
in Room 1707, 17/F, North Point Government Offices
(confirmed at 85th Meeting of PSC held on 9.9.2013)**

Present :	Mr. K. K. Ling	D of Plan (Chairman)	
	Mr. Edwin Tsang	HKIS	
	Mr. P. Y. Tam	HKIP	
	Ms. Susan Leung	HKIA	
	Mr. Alexander Duggie	HKILA	
	Mr. James Fan	REDA	
	Mr. Ma Kim See	AAP	
	Ir. Siu Yin-wai	HKIE	
	Mr. Jim Lam	CES/HQ (Atg.), LandsD	
	Mr. Johnson Wong	PEPO (SA) (Atg.), EPD	
	Ms. Portia Yiu	SPO/6, HD	
	Mr. W.Y. Lam	Tech. Secy., PlanD (Secretary)	
	In attendance:	Mr. Ivan Chung	DPO/SKIs, PlanD
Mr. David Lo		CE/HKI&I, CEDD	
Mr. C.K. Lam		SE/HKI&I, CEDD	
Mr. Chris Romanos		Consultant	
Mr. Daman Lee		Consultant	
Ms. Bess Cheng		Consultant	
Absent with Apologies :	Mr. Shuki Leung	REDA	
	Ir. Thomas Ho	HKCA	
	Miss Ophelia Wong	DD/D, PlanD	
	Ms. Phyllis Li	DD/T, PlanD	
	Mr. Kepler Yuen	AS (Cross-boundary)1, DEVB	
	Mr. Edward Li	STP/TPU, CEDD	

1. Introduction

- 1.1 The Chairman welcomed members to the meeting. The meeting noted that Mr. Shuki Leung of REDA, Ir. Thomas Ho of HKCA, Miss Ophelia Wong and Ms. Phyllis Li of PlanD, Mr. Kepler Yuen of DEVB and Mr. Edward Li of CEDD had informed the Secretary that they were unable to attend the meeting due to other work commitments.

2. Tung Chung New Town Extension Study – Stage 2 Public Engagement (PSC Paper No. 5/2013)

2.1 The Chairman welcomed representatives of PlanD, CEDD and the consultants attending the meeting. Mr. Ivan Chung said that members were consulted on the Stage 1 Public Engagement (PE) on envisioning in formulating development options of the Tung Chung New Town Extension Study (the Study) at the PSC meeting held on 21.6.2012. In the Stage 1 PE, about 2,300 written comments were received and the public generally agreed that Tung Chung had potential for further development. The initial land use options of the Study had been formulated for public consultation under Stage 2 PE, which commenced on 21.5.2013 for 2 months. Views/Comments received from the Stage 2 PE would be one of the important inputs in formulating the draft outline development plan for further public consultation.

2.2 With the aid of a Powerpoint presentation, Mr. Chris Romanos briefed members on the planning principles in formulating the initial land use options for Tung Chung as follows:

- Meeting housing needs;
- Improving connectivity;
- Providing balanced allocation of facilities and open spaces;
- Promoting economic development;
- Adopting sustainable urban design; and
- Preserving heritage and ecology.

2.3 Mr. Chris Romanos continued to say that having regard to the Tung Chung navigation channel, the NEF noise contours, the planned Tuen Mun–Chek Lap Kok Link, the ecology of the Tai Ho Inlet and Tung Chung Bay and Tung Chung River, the Study proposed 2 reclamation areas of about 120 ha at Tung Chung East (TCE) and 14 ha at Tung Chung West (TCW) respectively. The 2 proposed reclamation areas

would be connected to the existing Tung Chung new town by proposed extensions of the Tung Chung Line with provision of the new TCE and TCW stations, roads, cycle tracks and pedestrian footpaths. The key components in the design of the two reclamation areas included:

- a transport oriented development (TOD) concept to allow higher development intensity within 500m walking distance of the new MTR stations;
- waterfront promenades (about 20m to 40m wide) in TCE and TCW;
- north-south linear parks in TCE to allow visual relief and to enhance air ventilation and pedestrian mobility;
- a town park to the east of Yat Tung Estate to integrate heritage and local culture into landscaped open space with pedestrian links to Ma Wan Chung Village;
- stepped building height profile descending towards the waterfront to allow a better urban design configuration and to maximise views towards the sea;
- a balanced mix of public and private housing for the whole Tung Chung to create a harmonious community;
- areas of ecological importance along Tung Chung Bay and Tung Chung River to be preserved; and
- G/IC facilities and open space to cater for the needs of the planned population in accordance with the HKPSG and the location and distribution of those facilities would be accessible to the neighbourhood and to serve as visual relief to the built-up areas.

Tung Chung East (TCE) Reclamation

2.4 Mr. Chris Romanos stated that two land use themes, namely 'Livable Town' and 'Economic Vibrancy' were proposed for TCE. The 'Livable Town' theme would optimise the development potential of land with convenient access to the TCE station under the TOD concept and with a 'Metro Core Area' proposed for mixed residential and commercial uses near the TCE station. The domestic plot ratio (PR) would range from 5 to 6 near the TCE station and descended to PR 4 to the north and PR 3 near the waterfront. Linear parks and landscaped areas would be provided to allow visual relief/corridors and to enhance air ventilation

and pedestrian mobility within TCE. Land would also be reserved for supporting G/IC facilities (including a sports ground) to serve the planned population of about 111,000 accommodated in about 3,800 flats.

- 2.5 Mr. Chris Romanos said that the ‘Economic Vibrancy’ theme aimed at developing TCE to become a regional commercial hub for business and tourism development as TCE was in close proximity to the existing and planned strategic infrastructures. More land in TCE would be reserved for commercial development and with a higher non-domestic PR for the Metro Core Area, about 450,000 m² of floor area would be provided for regional office retail/hotel uses. The vibrancy of TCE would be further enhanced by a proposed 350-berth marina at the south-eastern edge of TCE and the proposed waterfront dining and retail uses at the northern side of the reclamation. The theme would provide about 3,300 flats for a planned population of 95,000.

Tung Chung West (TCW) Reclamation

- 2.6 For TCW, Mr. Chris Romanos said that the overall development intensity would be lower than that of TCE to strike a balance between development and conservation. The PRs of the proposed land uses included: up to PRs 5 and 6 for higher density developments in the southern part of TCW with a visually dominant mountain backdrop; domestic PR 3 for the area adjoining Yat Tung Estate that overlooked Tung Chung Bay; domestic PR of 1.5 for areas near the village cluster and domestic PR 0.75 for areas near the Tung Chung River estuary. Residential development with domestic PRs 3 and 5, local commercial area, waterfront promenade and G/IC facilities were proposed within the 14 ha reclamation area in TCW. The proposed new developments would provide about 15,000 flats for a planned population of about 43,000. Mr. Chris Romanos said that the initial land use options had been put forward for consultation in the

various activities of the stage 2 PE which commenced on 21 May 2013 for 2 months. A public forum was scheduled for 13 July 2013.

Discussions

- 2.7 In response to the Chairman, Mr. Ivan Chung said that local residents and community groups had actively participated in the stage 2 PE activities. So far there were diverse feedbacks on the initial land use options and reclamation received from the various stakeholders including green groups and local residents.
- 2.8 Mr. P. Y. Tam had the following comments on the initial land use options :
- the type of housing in addressing housing needs should be one of the planning principles;
 - there should be adequate transport links from Tung Chung to other parts of Hong Kong as Tung Chung was situated at the end of the transport network;
 - to achieve balanced development in Tung Chung, there should be timely provision of more job opportunities for the planned population other than those employments associated with the airport;
 - there should be detailed and sensitive design of the coastline of the TCW reclamation for preserving the bio-diversity of the area; and
 - seawall of the TCE reclamation might adopt a more indented design to become more interesting.
- 2.9 Mr. Edwin Tsang said that Tung Chung new town and the airport had been under very good planning and implementation in the past and he supported the initial land use options, including the residential uses, commercial/office/retail uses to support the airport and create jobs for Tung Chung residents. He suggested PlanD to initiate a regional/strategic study for the whole of Lantau Island to examine potentials for further reclamation along coast of Lantau east, Peng Chau and Hei Ling Chau; and transport links between Tung Chung and Lantau

east.

- 2.10 In response to Mr. James Fan, the Chairman said that the initial land use options of the Study were put forward for public consultation and there was no need for members representing property developers and professional institutes to declare interest at the meeting.
- 2.11 Mr. James Fan supported the initial land use options of the Study. He pointed out that as the public had expressed concerns on reclamation, further development of existing land should be considered by the Study including extending the boundaries of the Study area and increasing the development intensity of TCW as a PR of 0.75 seemed low for Tung Chung Valley where house development was not at all suitable.
- 2.12 Mr. Ivan Chung responded to members' comments as follows:
- the existing public to private housing ratio of Tung Chung in terms of population was 56:44. In the initial land use options, more private housing was intended for TCW as it was now dominated by public housing. However, the overall housing mix would be subject to further review in preparation of the outline development plan;
 - land for commercial use had been reserved for future economic activities which would provide a variety of jobs for future Tung Chung residents;
 - local villagers and Tung Chung residents consulted so far did not have adverse views on the TCE reclamation. For the TCW reclamation, an ecological survey conducted confirmed the ecological importance of Tung Chung River and Tung Chung Bay. The proposed TCW reclamation, which did not involve natural coastline, would be confirmed to the north-eastern part of Tung Chung Bay with lower ecological value. As revealed by the findings of a hydrodynamic model conducted, the water flow of Tung Chung Bay would not be adversely affected by the reclamation; and
 - PR 0.75 was proposed for the development sites in Tung Chung Valley to take into account the rural environment as well as the adjoining future village type development of recognised villages.

- 2.13 Mr. David Lo supplemented that ecologically important species in Tung Chung River were duly respected. It would be preserved by a 30m wide buffer zone on both sides of the river bank and the drainage impact assessment conducted did not recommend river channel works to be undertaken. For TCE, as the waterfront would be unique for development, the proposed indented coastline in the northern area would provide a lengthy waterfront for enjoyment of the future residents.
- 2.14 The Chairman remarked that the proposed marina at TCE might require a basin/inlet for wave protection. In response, Mr. Chris Romanos said that inlet for boats would be provided in the detailed design. Mr. P Y Tam stated that the south-eastern edge of the TCE reclamation might not be ideal for the proposed marina as it was situated close to the entrance to Tai Ho Wan, which was already blocked by the future bridges of the Tuen Mun–Chek Lap Kok Link.
- 2.15 Mr. Alexander Duggie said that the Study should provide information on the overall planned population of Tung Chung for reference. As Tung Chung was isolated from the rest of the Territory and the future economic activities would provide more job opportunities for the middle class, he suggested adopting a higher percentage of private housing in Tung Chung. Moreover, he had the following comments on the initial land use options:
- Tung Chung West*
- the TCW reclamation was subject to a number of constraints and the 14 ha reclamation area might destroy the natural coastline and obstruct views from the Tung Chung Valley, visual impact assessment study should be undertaken for the proposal. Consideration should be given to slightly enlarge the TCE reclamation to compensate for deleting the TCW reclamation;
 - the proposed residential development adjoining the town park was not supported as it might affect the whole recreation concept for the area, the site should preferably be reserved for sports activities;
 - the viability of the proposed TCW station should be examined;

Tung Chung East

- the proposed development at TCE was supported as it optimised intensity of development near the TCE station under the TOD concept;
- the proposed marina was a good idea as such facilities were lacking, but operation of the proposed marina might affect the ecology of Tai Ho Wan in the vicinity;
- the proposed marina would enhance property value, as such the G/IC site (for sports complex) should be reserved for residential use; and
- the urban design concept of the existing Tung Chung new town was well-received and should continue to be adopted in TCE instead of the stepped heights concepts proposed.

2.16 Ms. Susan Leung conveyed views of HKIA on the initial land use options to the meeting as follows:

- the proposed extension to Tung Chung new town were supported and the TCW reclamation should not have adverse impacts on the ecology of the area;
- for TCE, the TOD concept, green and visual corridors proposed were agreeable. However, intermixes of high and low building profiles might be more interesting than the proposed stepped building height profile; and
- land use options might also include economic activities for logistics, China trade, etc., to take advantage of Tung Chung's proximity to the Hong Kong International Airport.

2.17 Mr. Ma Kim See agreed to the Study proposals and had the following comments:

- the TCW reclamation, which covered only 14 ha, might not be cost effective;
- the proposed marina at TCE was needed, but it should preferably be facing north;
- further physical access, including decking over roads, should be provided to enhance the connectivity within TCW and a continuous promenade connecting to Tung Chung town centre should also be considered; and
- preservation of whole of the green area to the further west of TCW might not be necessary.

2.18 Mr. Ivan Chung and Mr. Chris Romanos responded to members' comments as follows:

- TCW would have a higher percentage (about 60%) of private housing and subject to the ODP to be prepared, a balanced split for public housing and private housing for Tung Chung new town would be achieved upon full development;
- the Lantau Concept Plan had proposed a planned population of 220,000 for Tung Chung new town. The Study was tasked to come up with land use proposals in meeting housing needs and to achieve sustainable development was one of the Study objectives;
- land was reserved to provide commercial GFA to cater for job requirements of Tung Chung residents. The proposed Metro Core Area in TCE would allow mix use development including different economic activities;
- on the stepped building height design concept, references had been made to the planning and engineering considerations highlighted in the digest for the stage 2 PE. The descending PRs and building heights towards the waterfront had taken into account the airport height restrictions, NEF contours, the air ventilation considerations as well as the visual and landscape value of the surrounding environment;
- preliminary environment assessment had shown that the proposed marina at TCE would not have adverse impacts on the surrounding environment, EIA study would be conducted for the Study;
- the proposed housing development site near the town park was intended for terraced housing and would not be suitable for sports complex use;
- the TCW station had been long requested by residents of Yat Tung Estate and the currently proposed location was considered viable as it would serve the planned population of 43,000 for TCW and the existing population. The study team would further discuss the feasibility of the proposed station with the Railway Development Office of Highways Department; and
- the green area at TCW comprised agricultural land and was within the village environ boundaries of the recognised villages where further development warranted detailed consideration.

2.19 The Chairman stated that there would be controversial views on the TCW reclamation and the Study had attempted to maximise the opportunity to identify land in meeting housing needs. The bridgehead economy of

Tung Chung would create large number of jobs for future Tung Chung residents and there were better opportunities for future Tung Chung residents, including those residing in public housing, to adjust and match jobs provided. He added that locating the proposed marina at the waterfront of the TCE reclamation might help to put the residential sites further away from the NEF contours, but impacts on the navigation channel would have to be examined. Moreover, he asked whether there was consideration to locate the proposed marina in TCW. Mr. Daman Lee responded that a marina located within the water body of Tung Chung Bay would have adverse ecological impacts.

2.20 Mr. P Y Tam asked whether the Study had also considered the future Siu Ho Wan (SHW) development in one go as economic activities and jobs in Tung Chung might support more development in SHW. In response, Mr. Ivan Chung said that SHW depot development was a separate study undertaken by MTRC and SHW was also included in CEDD's study on Enhancing Land Supply Strategy: Reclamation outside Victoria Harbour and Road Cavern Development. The Study would keep in view the latest findings of those studies.

2.21 As members had no further comments, the Chairman thanked members for their valuable comments. He also thanked the representatives of CEDD, PlanD and the consultants for the briefing. They left the meeting at this juncture.

3. Confirmation of Minutes of Last Meeting held on 20.5.2013

3.1 Mr. P. Y. Tam said that he had some comments on the draft minutes of last meeting and would send them to the Secretary. The Chairman said

that confirmation of the draft minutes of last meeting would defer to the next meeting.

4. Any Other Business

4.1 Mr. Edwin Tsang suggested inviting representative of Transport Department to advise members the present position on revision of parking standards. The Chairman replied that PlanD would relay the request to TD for consideration.

4.2 There being no other business, the meeting closed at 4:00 p.m.