

Appendix T

Analysis for Development Proposals

Analysis for Development Proposals

<u>Major suggestions:</u>	<u>Analysis:</u>
Development Proposal 1 - Tung Chung Rural Committee (TCRC)	
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Proposal only of focuses on Tung Chung West • Develop new tourism and economic zone with medium-to-low density housings on fallow agricultural lands whilst retaining the local villages. Reclamation is not recommended. • Improve existing connectivity of villages to other part of Tung Chung • Provide facilities such as car parks, museums, ecological parks, organic farms and open theatres at two sides of Tung Chung Valley. • Develop Nim Yuen and Lam Che Villages (which are currently underused) for other uses such as columbarium and Buddhist temples. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The proposal involves two major development areas - Tung Chung East and Tung Chung West, and both of them will form an integral part of the existing Tung Chung New Town. • In our options, certain pieces of fallow agricultural land are proposed for tourism and commercial uses with medium-to-low density housing, taken into account of their respective environmental constraints. • All our options will retain the existing local villages as well as their respective Village Environs. • The reclamation extents are proposed based on findings of relevant studies and they are proved to be environmental and ecologically acceptable. In response to public concerns, the proposed reclamation in Tung Chung West is limited to 14ha at the north eastern part of Tung Chung Bay. • • While internal pedestrian routes will be enhanced within the Tung Chung Valley, connectivity of the villages with other parts of Tung Chung will also be enhanced with the extended waterfront promenade from Tung Chung East, where additional pedestrian and cycling links will be provided. • Conservation Area and Green Belt are proposed in the Tung Chung Valley. Detailed provision of other suggested facilities will be considered and reviewed at the detailed PODP Stage. • Both Nim Yuen and Lam Che are recognized villages in Tung Chung Valley. One of our development principles is no encroachment onto any of these villages and their respective VEs. Meanwhile, land use compatibility of the future development and the villages will be carefully reviewed.

<u>Major suggestions:</u>	<u>Analysis:</u>
Development Proposal 1 - Tung Chung Rural Committee (TCRC)	
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Develop a Comprehensive Development Area (CDA) between Yat Tung Estate and Hau Wong Temple with combination of high-density residential development and shopping malls. • Develop Ma Wan Chung and nearby areas into a business zone with multiple tourist attractions such as a fisherman’s wharf, waterfront promenades, restaurants and water transportation. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Developing a CDA in this location may not be appropriate due to the ecological value in the area and the close proximity to Hau Wong Temple. The area between Yat Tung Estate and Hau Wong Temple are proposed for medium-density residential development, which are considered as compatible with its surrounding environment. Commercial facilities will be provided nearby to serve the needs of the future residents. • Ma Wan Chung village is considered essential to the character of the area and that its identity should be enhanced in our future development. Apart from improving the access to and from the village, it is also proposed to enhance the village’s waterfront area to transform it into a tourist destination with a renowned identity as a traditional village and the spectacular outdoor dining experience at its seafood restaurants.

<u>Major suggestions:</u>	<u>Analysis:</u>
Development Proposal 2 - 關注東涌發展大聯盟	
<p>General</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Develop fallow agricultural lands and existing villages but no reclamation in Tung Chung West. • Build an MTR station and extend Yu Tung Road with roads and cycling paths to link Tung Chung West and East. • Turn the Public Transport Interchange in Area 3 to Area 1 and building shopping malls and office towers on top of the Interchange instead of the originally planned G/IC facilities. • Develop Sha Lo Wan Area, Tin Sum Area, Pak Mong Area and Siu Ho Wan Depot. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • In our options, fallow agricultural land that are less sensitive in terms of ecological and cultural value has been proposed for development • The proposed reclamation extent for Tung Chung West is limited to the north eastern part of Tung Chung Bay with lower ecological value. The extent of the proposed reclamation will be limited to 14ha, which will not significantly change sea-water flows within the Bay based on preliminary assessment. This current reclamation extent has been largely reduced to balance development need and public aspiration for environmental conservation. • • Two new MTR stations, one in Tung Chung East and one in Tung West are proposed. A new major road from the roundabout on Tung Chung Waterfront Road to Yu Tung Road is proposed, providing a convenient access linking up Tung Chung East and Tung Chung West. The Waterfront Promenade proposed along the coastline of Tung Chung East and Tung Chung West also serves as an important linkage between the two areas. • According to the Tung Chung Town Centre Layout Plan L/I-TCTC/1E, Area 3 and Area 1 on top of the Public Transport Interchange in the existing Tung Chung Town Centre are planned for a Town Hall and hotel development respectively. The feasibility of the suggested shopping malls and office towers is not within the scope of this Study but will be studied by concerned Government departments. • According to the Brief of the Study, Sha Lo Wan, Tin Sum and Siu Ho Wan Depot are located outside the Study Area so they are not within the scope of the Study. • Pak Mong, to the west of Tai Ho Wan, is located outside the Potential New Town Expansion Area. Under the current proposal, there is no development in Pak Mong and due to the high ecological value of Tai Ho Wan, development in Pak Mong is not suggested.

<u>Major suggestions:</u>	<u>Analysis:</u>
Development Proposal 2 - 關注東涌發展大聯盟	
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Extend existing cycling paths to Sunny Bay and Tin Sum area. <p>Southwest Tung Chung Area</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Develop a green belt. • Develop medium density private housings in Ngau Au, Lam Che and Nim Yuen villages, and medium density public housings in the inland areas behind Shek Lau Po village. The ratio of private and public housings is 6:4. This could house an extra population of around 70000 in the southwest part of Tung Chung. • Develop G/IC and cultural / recreational facilities, e.g. sports ground at the middle of Tung Chung Valley (covering the area of Shek Lau Po village) and other facilities including a civic centre, schools and police and fire stations nearby. <p>Tung Chung East</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Carry out reclamation and develop medium-to-low density housings or resort hotels. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • According to the Brief of the Study, these two areas are not within the scope of this Study. • In all our options, an elongated green belt is proposed along the western edge of Tung Chung Valley to serve as a buffer area between the new developments and the North Lantau (Extension) Country Park to the west. • Ngau Au, Lam Che and Nim Yuen are all recognized villages in Tung Chung Valley. One of our development principles is no encroachment onto any of these villages and their respective VEs. Outside the VEs, a low-dense rural residential area to the north and south of Shek Lau Po is proposed. Meanwhile, a relatively high density residential area to the east of Shek Lau Po along Tung Chung Road is proposed. • There are areas reserved for G/IC and cultural/recreational facilities in Tung Chung West (including Tung Chung Valley) in all our options. Suggestions on the type and location of facilities in Tung Chung West will be considered and reviewed at the detailed PODP stage. • A total of 120ha of reclaimed land is proposed in Tung Chung East. Medium-to-high density housing is provided in both options, striking a balance between housing supply and quality living environment. • There are plenty of commercial spaces in Tung Chung East that offer opportunities for hotels etc., in particular for Theme 2 – Economic Vibrancy. • .

<u>Major suggestions:</u>	<u>Analysis:</u>
Development Proposal 2 - 關注東涌發展大聯盟	
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Develop a waterfront park in reclamation area and make use of the waterfront for local businesses. <p>Ma Wan Chung</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Develop “Conservation and Revitalisation” area in Ma Wan Chung and Wong Nai Uk to preserve the cultural heritage there such as Tung Chung Battery and the Tung Chung old pier. • Develop the land at the south of Sha Tsui Tau and near Ma Wan Village into a commercial area with flea and free markets established for developing small local businesses and provide more employment opportunities. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • In order to maximize the waterfront potential of both Tung Chung East and West, extension of the current waterfront promenade from the existing Tung Chung Town Centre to areas along the coastline of Tung Chung East is proposed. Two Waterfront Parks along the promenade would be provided in both Theme 1 and Theme 2. Besides, the waterfront areas will be used for various commercial activities including retail, dining and marina etc., providing opportunities for local businesses. • We proposed to conserve and revitalize Ma Wan Chung Village through enhancing its identity as a traditional fishing village and spectacular outdoor dining venue. The development of the Town Park will integrate the various cultural heritages in the area, including Tung Chung Battery to create a major open space for public enjoyment. • Commercial uses are proposed in the area around Sha Tsui Tau that offer opportunities for flea and free markets in the future.

<u>Major suggestions:</u>	<u>Analysis:</u>
Development Proposal 3 - Joint Green Groups	
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Strongly against reclamation, engineering work, channelisation and development in Tung Chung Bay, Tung Chung River Valley and nearby coastal areas due to high ecological value of the area. • Propose conservation planning, management and monitoring to preserve natural resources for nature conservation, community use and enjoyment, and fisheries. • Rehabilitate the channelised / damaged artificial river sections and prohibit any development that brings water pollution to the channels and estuary. • Preserve Tung Chung River, woodlands and the coast as “Site of Special Scientific Interest”, “Conservation Area” and “Costal Protection Area” zones. • Promote compatible community use and enjoyment in Tung Chung River Valley and the estuary through environmental education and passive recreation activities with ecologically friendly facilities such as eco-trails, a riverside park, a nature education centre, resting places and look-out towers. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Reclamation of only 14ha in Tung Chung West is proposed around Ma Wan Chung Inlet, where ecological values are relatively low. And no reclamation has been proposed at the Tung Chung River Valley. • We are well-aware of the need for natural conservation in Tung Chung and we will take into account of this throughout the Study. Opportunities to make use of the natural resources for public enjoyment will be explored in the Study. • One of the tasks of this Study is to explore on the strategy, methodology and techniques in rehabilitating the channelized/ artificial river sections within the Study Area and this will be examined at the later stage of the Study. • In any case, future development will avoid inducing water pollution to the channels and the Tung Chung Estuary. For instance, 30m from both banks of the Tung Chung Stream is proposed as Conservation Area for preservation purpose. • All developments will not encroach onto the existing “Site of Special Scientific Interest” area in Tung Chung. In our options, woodland with high ecological values and ecologically sensitive areas of the Tung Chung Stream will be well preserved. For instance, 30m land ribbons from both banks of the Stream are planned as part of Conservation Area as a buffer. We will continue to work closely with the EIA process and review the appropriateness to apply the suggested zonings in the Tung Chung Valley area. • In all our options, Conservation Area in Tung Chung Valley is proposed. The Zone could preserve the ecological value of the area while increasing its scenic and recreational potential. There are opportunities for eco-tourism facilities such as walking trails within the Conservation Area.

<u>Major suggestions:</u>	<u>Analysis:</u>
Development Proposal 3 - Joint Green Groups	
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Enhance touristic appeal of Tung Chung River Valley through improved linkage to existing Country Parks in Lantau and other neighbouring tourist spots including Ngong Ping 360, Po Lin Monastery and the Tian Tan Buddha Statue. • Develop small-scale Village Type Development and G/IC facilities in the valley. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Improving linkage to outside Tung Chung is outside the scope of this Study. Nevertheless, it is considered essential to maintain and enhance the linkage with these existing tourist spots, in particular for options which promote Tung Chung into a recreational/tourism hub. This principle will be adopted throughout the Study. • In some of the options, low-dense residential development is proposed in the valley while G/IC facilities would be provided next to Tung Chung Road.

<u>Major suggestions:</u>	<u>Analysis:</u>
Development Proposal 4 - Urban Design & Planning Consultants Limited (UDP)	
<p>General</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Build mid-rise mixed land use development along the waterside, high-rise further inland within the reclamation area and low-rise to mid-rise in the valley • Build an MTR extension to Tung Chung West. • Build a resort area at the middle of the valley with mid-rise development. • Provide community facilities, educational institutions, eco-tourism facilities and elderly housing in the inner part of the Valley with low-density development. • Build “Town Park” between Yat Tung Estate and Tung Chung Town Centre. • Establish a visitor centre zone immediately adjacent to the west side of Yat Tung Estate to facilitate the tourism development in Tung Chung West. <p>Development option 1 (Channel Option)</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • 39 ha of reclamation with the existing water preserved and 136.6 ha of inland area, with estimated population of about 70,000. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • For the reclamation area, we will adopt a stepped building height profile with medium-rise buildings along the waterfront to enable a smooth transition of height from the higher topography of the country park to the waterfront. Development within Tung Chung Valley will generally be low-rise to ensure its compatibility with the existing rural character. Medium to high-rise development in the valley will only be proposed on an elongated site along Tung Chung Road, which is located at the foothill of the Wo Liu Tun slope. • There will be a proposed new Tung Chung West Station in all our options. • Conservation Area and low-dense residential sites are proposed in the middle part of the valley, which offer opportunities for the suggested uses in the future. • We have proposed G/IC uses, Conservation Area and low-dense residential areas in the Valley that provide opportunities for the suggested uses in the future. • There will be a Town Park between Yat Tung Estate and Tung Chung New Town. The Park will be developed integrating the various heritage sites and providing linkage between the Tung Chung Town Centre and Tung Chung West to create a unique recreational experience for residents and visitors. • There are opportunities for eco-tourism facilities within the Conservation Area in Tung Chung Valley to serve visitors. • • Noted.

<u>Major suggestions:</u>	<u>Analysis:</u>
Development Proposal 4 - Urban Design & Planning Consultants Limited (UDP)	
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Create waterfront promenade along both sides of the water channels to provide enjoyable public space for walking, biking and fishing activities. <p>Development option 2 (Island Option)</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • 34 ha of “Tung Chung island” reclamation and 142 ha of inland area, with estimated population of about 51,000. • Revitalise existing fishing village to strengthen the cultural heritage and add character to the area. • Create waterfront promenade around the island to provide enjoyable public space for walking, biking and fishing activities with the possibility of developing water sports. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • A 30m Conservation Area is proposed from both banks of Tung Chung Stream. This zone provides opportunities for visitors and local residents to have leisure/ recreational activities. • Noted. • All options will propose revitalizing Ma Wan Chung Village through enhancing its identity as a visitor destination featuring traditional fishing village culture and spectacular outdoor dining experience at seafood restaurants. • Although there is no similar large-scale island development in our options, an extended waterfront promenade linking up Tung Chung East and West will be provided. Promenade Parks and open space along the coast could be utilized for various commercial and recreational activities including cycling, retail, dining and marina etc.

<u>Major suggestions:</u>	<u>Analysis:</u>
Development Proposal 5 - Kenneth To & Associate Limited (KTA)	
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Develop 175 ha in Tung Chung West without reclamation and estimated population of 55,000. • Suggest a ratio of 3:7 between public and private housings with three residential zones. Zone 1 with high density Public Rental Housing at the waterfront area and at the middle of Tung Chung Valley, surrounding the proposed MTR station in the CDA. Zones 2 and 3 with medium-density housing at the periphery of Tung Chung Valley. • Existing villages should remain intact (no relocation) with “Village Type Development” zones proposed. • Propose two additional MTR stations, one immediately west of Yat Tung Estate and the other in the middle of Tung Chung Valley in the CDA zone. • Develop a comprehensive cycling track network along the waterfront and inland area to promote an environmental friendly transport mode. • Propose a G/IC, local and international school sites in the middle of Tung Chung Valley and near the proposed MTR station. • Propose a “recreation” zone with a youth hostel, international youth centres and water sports centres at the waterfront area near the existing Tung Chung Outdoor Recreation Camp and Hau Wong Temple. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Noted. • An average public to private housing ratio of about 50:50 is adopted for the proposed development. Taking into account the existing development in Tung Chung, the overall ratio is about 55:45. It is considered that this housing mix could achieve a more balanced socio-economic profile for the new town. • There would be high-density residential development at area around the proposed MTR stations and at the eastern periphery of Tung Chung Valley along the Tung Chung Road. • As set out in one of our development principles, future development will not encroach to any of the existing villages and their respective VEs. • A Comprehensive Development Area with an MTR station in the middle of Tung Chung Valley may not be appropriate due to the ecological value in the area and the compatibility with adjacent developments. • The two suggested MTR Stations are too close and not cost-effective. In our options, we have proposed a new MTR Station at Area 39 in Tung Chung West to maximise the catchment area of the station. • The cycle track network will be incorporated into the extended waterfront promenade system linking Tung Chung West and East. • There is a G/IC site proposed in Tung Chung Valley, next to Tung Chung Road, providing convenient access to the future residents in the area. • The the area is proposed as G/IC and Open Space which provides opportunities for the suggested facilities and they will be considered and reviewed at the detailed PODP stage.

<u>Major suggestions:</u>	<u>Analysis:</u>
Development Proposal 5 - Kenneth To & Associate Limited (KTA)	
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Provide public open space with comprehensive network of greenery and waterfront promenade along Tung Chung Bay and Tung Chung River. • Propose a large town park at the northeast part of Tung Chung West with more trees and more sports facilities such as ball courts and playgrounds. • Avoid impact on various historical sites including Tung Chung Fort and Battery, Hau Wong Temple, Tung Chung Game Board Carving and Ma Wan Chung. • Propose two “Other Specified Uses” annotated “Resort” zonings at the west of Yat Tung Estate for a proposed resort development with hotel in a low density area with retail and al fresco dining facilities, and a Fisherman’s Wharf as an extension of the existing Ma Wan Chung Fishing Village. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • A comprehensive network of public open space lined with extensive tree planting and benthic landscapes will be provided in all our options. Apart from the extended waterfront promenade connecting Tung Chung Valley and Tung Chung East, inland areas will also be connected to the waterfront via the extension of the existing pedestrian spine, linear park greenway in Tung Chung East; town park in Tung Chung West and Conservation Area in Tung Chung Valley. • The Town Park will be developed integrating the various heritage sites and providing linkage between the Tung Chung Town Centre and Tung Chung West to create a unique recreational experience for residents and visitors. Sports and recreational facilities will be provided, taking into account the existing situation, to ensure sufficient provisions in the future. • As set out in our development principles, all our options will not encroach onto historical sites within the Study Area. Rather, it is intended to preserve their cultural/historical value and promote their integration with the future developments. • We have proposed medium-dense residential and commercial use at the two areas, provide opportunities for the suggested use in the future. • Our proposal share a similar development concept for Ma Wan Chung Fishing village, to transform it into a tourist destination with a renowned identity as a traditional village and the spectacular outdoor dining experience at its seafood restaurants.

<u>Major suggestions:</u>	<u>Analysis:</u>
Development Proposal 6 - other individual	
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Oppose to reclamation in Tung Chung Bay and suggested reclamation near Caribbean Coast. • Retro fitting existing roundabouts at traffic light controlled junctions at various locations. • Improve connectivity between Tung Chung and other areas by opening the connection between the existing Tung Chung Eastern Interchange and Cheung Tung Road, and joining up the expressway with Cheung Tung Road at Siu Ho Wan. • Improve MTR train frequency, station and digital raideo service. • Build a small free standing iron bridge for cyclists to cycle safely along the seawall road. • Reduce air pollution from nearby infrastructures by allowing only low-emission vehicles on the new HKZMB, making all airport carriers use low polluting and clean fuels and rationalising the bus services to and from the airport. • Reduce noise pollution by installing vehicle noise barriers along Shun Tung Road and Tat Tung Road. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Reclamation of only 16ha in Tung Chung West is proposed around Ma Wan Chung Inlet, where ecological values are relatively low. And no reclamation has been proposed at the Tung Chung River Valley. Also, there will be a total amount of 120ha of reclamation in Tung Chung East • Not within the scope of this Study. • Not within the scope of this Study. • Not within the scope of this Study. • Not within the scope of this Study. • Not within the scope of this Study. • Not within the scope of this Study.